

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03327 1230

**FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS**

Volume I

**Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto**

Fall 1995

**These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.**

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 4 1995

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO


FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS

Volume I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Fall 1995

These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume I

Page

I. INTRODUCTION

Georges Erasmus and Joe Sanders, <i>Canadian History: An Aboriginal Perspective</i> , in <i>Nation to Nation: Aboriginal Sovereignty and the Future of Canada</i> (Englestad & Bird eds. 1992) 3-11	1
Alan D. McMillan, <i>Native Peoples and Cultures of Canada</i> (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1988)	8
Some Facts and Figures	27

II. THE POLITICS OF INDIGENOUS DIFFERENCE

<i>The Justice System and Aboriginal People</i> , in 1 <i>Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba</i> (1991) 115-117	33
Fred Plain, <i>A Treatise on the Rights of the Aboriginal Peoples of the Continent of North America</i> , in <i>The Quest for Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights</i> (Boldt & Long eds. 1985), 31-40	35
Russel Lawrence Barsh and James Youngblood Henderson, <i>The Road: Indian Tribes and Political Liberty</i> (1980), 270-79	42
Will Kymlicka, <i>Liberalism, Community and Culture</i> (1991)	44

III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

<i>R. v. Sparrow</i> , [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1075	49
---	----

IV. ABORIGINAL TITLE

A. The Royal Proclamation

<i>The Royal Proclamation of 1763</i> , R.S.C. 1970, App. II, No. 1	67
Brian Slattery, <i>The Hidden Constitution: Aboriginal Rights in Canada</i> (1984), 32 <i>Amer. J. Comp. Law</i> 361, at 368-72	68

B. The Marshall Trilogy

<i>Johnson v. M'Intosh</i> , 21 U.S. (8 Wheat.) 543 (1823)	73
<i>Cherokee Nation v. Georgia</i> , 30 U.S. (5 Pet.) 1 (1831) ...	77
<i>Worcester v. Georgia</i> , 31 U.S. (6 Pet.) 515 (1832)	81

C. The House of Lords

<i>St. Catherines Milling and Lumber Co. v. The Queen</i> (1888), 14 A.C. 46 (P.C.)	91
<i>In re Southern Rhodesia</i> , [1919] A.C. 211 (P.C.)	97
<i>Amodu Tijani v. The Secretary, Southern Nigeria</i> , [1921] 2 A.C. 399 (P.C.)	104

D. Canadian Principles

<i>Calder v. Attorney General of British Columbia</i> (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 145 (S.C.C.)	113
<i>Hamlet of Baker Lake v. Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development</i> , [1980] 1 F.C. 518 (F.C.T.D.)	127
<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)	142

E. Fiduciary Duty

<i>Guerin v. The Queen</i> (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (S.C.C.)	162
<i>Apsassin v. Canada (Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development)</i> (1993), 100 D.L.R. (4th) 504 (F.C.A.)	174
<i>Grand Council of the Crees v. Canada (National Energy Board)</i> (1994), 112 D.L.R. (4th) 129 (S.C.C.)	185

V. THE DISTRIBUTION OF LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Douglas Sanders, <i>The Constitution, the Provinces, and Aboriginal People</i> , in <i>Governments in Conflict: Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada</i> (Long & Boldt eds., 1988), 151-52	190
---	-----

A. Federal Jurisdiction

<i>Ontario Mining Co. v. Seybold</i> , [1903] A.C. 73 (P.C.) ...	192
<i>Re Eskimos</i> , [1939] 2 D.L.R. 417 (S.C.C.)	195
Note on <i>R. v. Derricksan</i> , 60 D.L.R. (3d) 140 (B.C.C.A.); (1976), 71 D.L.R. (3d) 159 (S.C.C.)	199

B. Provincial Jurisdiction

<i>Cardinal v. A.G. Alberta</i> (1973), 40 D.L.R. (3d) 553 (S.C.C.)	200
<i>Kruger and Manuel v. The Queen</i> (1977), 75 D.L.R. (3d) 434 (S.C.C.)	207
<i>Four B. Manufacturing v. United Garment Workers of America</i> (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 385 (S.C.C.)	212
<i>R. v. Sutherland</i> (1980), 113 D.L.R. (3d) 374 (S.C.C.) ..	219
<i>Dick v. The Queen</i> (1985), 23 D.L.R. (4th) 33 (S.C.C.) ..	221
<i>Jack and Charlie v. The Queen</i> (1985), 21 D.L.R. (4th) 641 (S.C.C.)	229
<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)	237
<i>R. v. Alphonse</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)	238

VI. TREATIES

<i>Map of Pre- and Post-Confederation Treaties</i>	241
--	-----

A. Introduction

Daniel J. Kuhlen, <i>A Layperson's Guide to Treaty Rights in Canada</i> (1985)	242
--	-----

B. The Classical Approach

<i>R. v. Syliboy</i> , [1929] 1 D.L.R. 307 (N.S. Co. Ct.)	257
---	-----

C. The Contractual Model

<i>Pawis v. The Queen</i> (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 602 (F.C.T.D.)	263
---	-----

Indian Chiefs of Alberta, "Citizens Plus," in *The Only*

<i>Good Indian</i> (1983)	268
<i>Johnston v. The Queen</i> (1966), 56 D.L.R. (2d) 749 (Sask. C.A.)	270
<i>R. v. Sikyea</i> (1964), 43 D.L.R. (2d) 150 (N.W.T.C.A.) ...	272
<i>Sikyea v. The Queen</i> , [1964] S.C.R. 642 (S.C.C.)	277

D. Recent Developments

<i>R. v. Taylor and Williams</i> (1981) 34 O.R. (2d) (C.A.) ...	278
<i>Simon v. The Queen</i> (1985), 24 D.L.R. (4th) 390 (S.C.C.)	286
<i>Sannichton Marina Ltd. v. Claxton</i> (1987), 18 B.C.L.R. (2d) 217 (B.C.S.C.)	296
<i>Horse v. The Queen</i> (1988), 47 D.L.R. (4th) 526 (S.C.C.)	301
<i>Horseman v. The Queen</i> , [1990] 4 W.W.R. 97 (S.C.C.)	307
<i>R. v. Sioui</i> , [1990] 70 D.L.R. (4th) 427 (S.C.C.)	320
Bruce W. Hodgins and Jamie Benidickson, <i>The Temagami Experience</i> (1989), 267	335
<i>A.G. Ontario v. Bear Island Foundation</i> (1991), 83 D.L.R. (4th) 381 (S.C.C.)	337
<i>Eastmain Band v. James Bay and Northern Quebec Agreement (Administrator)</i> (1992), 99 D.L.R. (4th) 16 (F.C.A.)	339
<i>R. v. Howard</i> (1994), 115 D.L.R. (4th) 312 (S.C.C.)	345
<i>R. v. Jones</i> (1993), 14 O.R. (3d) 421 (Prov. Div)	350

Volume II

VII. THE INDIAN ACT

A. General Principles

Claudia Notzke, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Natural Resources in Canada</i> (1994) 173-181	368
Leroy Little Bear, <i>Indian Government Pursuant to the Indian Act</i> , in <i>Pathways to Self-Determination: Canadian Indians and the Canadian State</i> (Little Bear, Boldt & Long	

eds. 1984)	377
<i>Logan v. Styres</i> (1959), 20 D.L.R. (2d) 416 (Ont. H.C.)..	383
<i>R. v. Gingrich</i> (1958), 29 W.W.R. 471 (Alta. App. Div.)..	387
<i>A.G.B.C. v. Wale</i> (1987), 9 B.C.L.R. (2d) 333 (B.C.C.A.)	390
Frank Cassidy and Robert L. Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 40-50	399

B. "Marrying Out"

<i>Indian Act</i> , R.S.C. 1970, c. I-16	408
<i>Lavell v. A.G. Canada</i> (1973), 38 D.L.R. (3d) 481 (S.C.C.)	410
<i>Lovelace v. Canada</i> , 36 U.N. GOAR Supp. (No. 40) Annex XVIII; U.N. Doc. A/36/40 (1981)	420
<i>Indian Act</i> , R.S.C. 1985, c. I-5	426
Report to Parliament, <i>Implementation of the 1985 Changes to the Indian Act</i> (1987), 8-11	428
<i>Enough is Enough: Aboriginal Women Speak Out</i> (Silman ed. 1987), 215-47	432
Catharine A. MacKinnon, <i>Feminism Unmodified: Discourses on Life and Law</i> (1987), 63-69	448

VIII. ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE

A. Introduction

Philip Zylberberg, <i>Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?</i> (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 75-79	453
---	-----

B. "The Best Interests of the Child"

<i>Racine v. Woods</i> (1983), 1 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.)	457
<i>B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services</i> (1988), 51 Man. Rep. (2d) 245 (Man. C.A.)	466
<i>B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 291	471
<i>Tom v. Winnipeg Children's Aid Society</i> (1982), 2 W.W.R.	

212 (Man. C.A.)	472
-----------------------	-----

C. Recent Developments

Philip Zylberberg, <i>Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?</i> (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 81-83	474
<i>C.J.K. v. Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto</i> , [1989] 4 C.N.L.R. 75 (Ont. Prov. Ct.)	477
<i>Re Family and Child Service Act of British Columbia</i> , [1990] 4 C.N.L.R. 14 (B.C. Prov. Ct.)	484
<i>Jane Doe v. Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba</i> (1990), 72 D.L.R. (4th) 738 (Man. Q.B.)	492

IX. RIGHTS OF THE METIS PEOPLE

Catherine Bell, <i>Who Are the Métis People in Section 35(2)?</i> (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 351	495
Paul Chartrand, <i>Aboriginal Rights: The Dispossession of the Métis</i> (1991), 29 Osgoode Hall L.J. 457	504
<i>Dumont v. A.G. Canada</i> (1988), 52 D.L.R. (4th) 25 (Man. C.A.)	516
<i>Dumont v. A. G. Canada</i> (1990), 67 D.L.R. (4th) 159 (S.C.C.)	526
<i>R. v. McPherson</i> , [1992] 4 C.N.L.R. 144 (Man. Prov. Ct.)	527

X. FIRST NATIONS AND THE CHARTER

Mary Ellen Turpel, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and the Canadian Charter: Interpretive Monopolies, Cultural Differences</i> (1989-90), 6 Can. Human Rights Yrbk. 3	539
<i>Eastmain Band v. Gilpin</i> , [1988] 3 C.N.L.R. (Que. Prov. Ct.)	544
<i>Manitoba Rice Farmers Association v. Manitoba Human Rights Commission</i> (1987), 50 Man. R. (2d) 92 (Q.B.)	554
<i>R. v. Willocks</i> , [1994] 1 C.N.L.R. (Ont. C.J.)	565
<i>Corbiere v. Canada (Minister of Indian and Northern Affairs)</i> (1993), 107 D.L.R. (4th) 582 (F.C.T.D.)	573

<i>Sawridge Band v. Canada</i> , [1995] F.C.J. No. 1013 (F.C.T.D.)	587
<i>Norris v. Thomas</i> , [1992] 2 C.N.L.R. 139 (B.C.S.C.)	608
J. Anthony Long and Katherine Beaty Chiste, <i>Indian Governments and the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> (1994), 18 American Indian Culture and Research Journal 91	619

XI. ABORIGINAL PEOPLE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE

<i>R. v. Machekequonabe</i> (1898), 28 O.R. 309 (Div. Ct.)	644
<i>Re Stacey and Montour and the Queen</i> (1981), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 61 (Que. C.A.)	646
Michael Jackson, <i>In Search of the Pathways to Justice: Alternative Dispute Resolution in Aboriginal Communities</i> , [1992] U.B.C. L. Rev. 147, at 148-160	649
<i>R. v. Moses</i> (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yukon Terr. Ct.)	658
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Criminal Justice</i> (Report No. 34, 1991), at 13-23	678
Bryan Schwartz, <i>A Separate Aboriginal Justice System?</i> (1990), 28 Man. L.J. 77	685
Jeremy Webber, <i>Individuality, Equality and Difference: Justifications for a Parallel System of Aboriginal Justice</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 133	695
Teressa Nahanee, <i>Dancing With a Gorilla: Aboriginal Women, Justice and the Charter</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 359	698
<i>R. v. F.(A.)</i> , [1995] 2 C.N.L.R. 151 (Ont. Gen. Div.) ...	704

Volume III

XII. ABORIGINAL GOVERNMENT

A. Introduction

Chief Ovide Mercredi, *First Nations and Self-Determination*, in *Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century* (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 161-66 .. 709

Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, *Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice* (1989), 160-66 714

Roger Gibbons, *Citizenship, Political, and Intergovernmental Problems With Indian Self-Government*, in *Arduous Journey: Canadian Indians and Decolonization* (Ponting ed. 1988), 369-377 718

B. Aboriginal Government and Constitutional Reform

Kathy L. Brock, *The Politics of Aboriginal Self-Government: A Canadian Paradox* (1991), 34 Can. Pub. Admin. 272 725

J. Edward Chamberlin, *Aboriginal Rights and the Meech Lake Accord*, in *Competing Constitutional Visions: The Meech Lake Accord* (Swinton & Rogerson eds., 1988), 11-19 734

Draft Legal Text of the Charlottetown Accord (October 9, 1992) 741

Globe and Mail, July 27, 1993, A2 748

Globe and Mail, July 28, 1993, A21 749

Globe and Mail, July 28, 1993, A20 750

C. Aboriginal Government and the Courts

Michael Asch and Patrick Macklem, *Aboriginal Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on R. v. Sparrow* (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 498 751

Hamar Foster, *Forgotten Arguments: Aboriginal Title and Sovereignty in Canada Jurisdiction Act Cases* (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 343 755

Brian Slattery, *First Nations and the Constitution: A Question of Trust* (1992), 71 Can. Bar Rev. 261 764

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, *Partners in*

<i>Confederation: Aboriginal Peoples, Self-Government, and the Constitution</i> (1993)	772
<i>Casimel v. I.C.B.C.</i> (1993), 106 D.L.R. (4th) 720 (B.C.C.A.)	787
<i>R. v. Pamajewon and Jones; R. v. Gardner</i> (1994), 120 D.L.R. (4th) 475 (S.C.C.)	976
Kent Roach, <i>Remedies for Violations of Aboriginal Rights</i> (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 498	806

D. Aboriginal Government and the Land Claims Process

Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 135-55	818
Task Force to Review Comprehensive Claims Policy, <i>Living Treaties: Lasting Agreements</i> (Ottawa: Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 1985)	832
Ministry of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, <i>Comprehensive Land Claims Policy</i> (1987)	841
Donald Purich, <i>The Inuit and Their Land</i> (1992)	855
Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, <i>British Columbia's Approach to Treaty Settlements - Lands and Resources</i> (May 12, 1995)	864
Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, <i>Treaty Making in the Spirit of Co-Existence: An Alternative to Extinction</i> (1995)	878

E. Aboriginal Government and Institutional Design

David C. Hawkes and Allan M. Maslove, <i>Fiscal Arrangements for Aboriginal Self-Government</i> , in <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Government Responsibilities: Exploring Federal and Provincial Roles</i> (Hawkes & Maslove eds., 1989), 103-106	885
Noel Lyon, <i>Aboriginal Self-Government: Rights to Citizenship and Access to Governmental Services</i> (1984), at 48-69	888
C.E.S. Franks, <i>Public Administration Questions Relating to Aboriginal Self-Government</i> (1987)	909
John Weinstein, <i>Aboriginal Self-Determination Off a Land Base</i> (1986)	921

XIII. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN THE UNITED STATES

A. General Principles

- Robert N. Clinton, Nell Jessup Newton and Monroe E. Price, *American Indian Law* (3d ed. 1991), 137-164 928
- Ex Parte Crow Dog*, 109 U.S. 556 (1883)..... 948
- Sidney L. Harring, *Crow Dog's Case: American Indian Sovereignty, Tribal Law, and United States Law in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 101-130..... 951
- United States v. Kagama*, 118 U.S. 375 (1886) 957
- Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock*, 187 U.S. 554 (1903) 960
- Tee-Hit-Ton Indians v. United States*, 348 U.S. 272 (1954) 963
- Morton v. Mancari*, 417 U.S. 535 (1974) 968
- Lyng v. Northwest Cemetery Protective Association*, 485 U.S. 439 (1988) 975

B. Tribal Government

- Talton v. Mayes*, 163 U.S. 376 (1896) 991
- Oliphant v. Suquamish Indian Tribe*, 435 U.S. 191 (1978) 995
- Duro v. Reina*, 110 Sup. Ct. 2053 (1990) 1001
- Frank Pommersheim, *The Contextual Legitimacy of Adjudication in Tribal Courts and the Role of the Tribal Bar as an Interpretive Community: An Essay*, 18 New Mex. L. Rev. 49 (1988) 1006

XIV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

- Garth Nettheim, *Australian Aborigines and the Law* (1987), 2 Law & Anthropology 371-84, 399-400 1018
- Mabo v. Queensland*, [1992] 5 C.N.L.R. 1 (Aust. H.C.) .. 1025
- Aboriginal Provisional Government, *The Australian Constitution: An Aid to Justice or an Accomplice to Oppression* (June 4, 1993) 1041

The Treaty of Waitangi, 1975 New Zealand Statutes 114,
Sch. 1 1063

E. Taihakurie Durie, *The New Zealand Maorie and the Waitangi Tribunal*, in *Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century* (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 149-59 . 1065

XV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

Robert Laurence, *Learning to Live With the Plenary Power of Congress Over the Indian People: An Essay in Reaction to Professor Williams' Algebra*, 30 Ariz. L. Rev. 413 (1988), at 428-30 1073

Robert A. Williams, Jr., *Learning to Live With Eurocentric Myopia: A Reply to Professor Laurence's Learning to Live With the Plenary Power of Congress Over the Indian Nations*, 30 Ariz. L. Rev. 439 (1988), at 454-55 1075

Ominayak v. Canada, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/38/D/167/1984 (Human Rights Committee decision released March 28, 1990) 1076

Grand Chief Donald Marshall and the Mikmaq Tribal Society v. Canada, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/43/D/205/1986 (Human Rights Committee decision released July 25, 1990) 1083

R.L. et al. v. Canada, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/43/D/358/1989 (Human Rights Committee decision released April 1, 1991) 1088

Draft Universal Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples 1097

S. James Anaya, *The Capacity of International Law to Advance Ethnic or Nationality Claims*, 75 Iowa L. Rev. 837 (1990) 1101

